

SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVERNMENT OF  
TECHNICAL CRITERIA OF EXTERNAL AUDIT

Tender # SEF/NP/15-16/21

| Reference of Members                                     |   | M-1        |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|---|------------|--|------|------|-----|-----|---------|------|--|------|-----|-----|---------|------|------|--|-----|-----|---------|------|------|------|--|-----|---------|------|------|------|-----|--|---------|--|--|--|--|--|
|  |   | M-2        |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
| Tender Opening Date 31 December,2015                     |   | M-3        |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |   | M-4        |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |   | M-5        |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
| S #  | IMPORTANT PRE-QUALIFICATION / ASSESSMENT POINTS   | Max. Marks | M/s. IJAZ TABUSSUM & CO                          |      |      |     |     |         |      | M/s.Deloitte                                     |      |     |     |         |      |      | M/s. Horwath Hussain Chaudhury & Co.             |     |     |         |      |      |      | M/s. Riaz Ahmad & Company                        |     |         |      |      |      |     | M/s. BDO Ebrahim & Co.                           |         |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |   |            | Obtain marks from Consultant Selection Committee |      |      |     |     |         |      | Obtain marks from Consultant Selection Committee |      |     |     |         |      |      | Obtain marks from Consultant Selection Committee |     |     |         |      |      |      | Obtain marks from Consultant Selection Committee |     |         |      |      |      |     | Obtain marks from Consultant Selection Committee |         |  |  |  |  |  |
| Technical Bid Maximum Score                              |   |            | M -5   | M -4 | M -3 | M-2 | M-1 | Average | M -5 | M -4   | M -3 | M-2 | M-1 | Average | M -5 | M -4 | M -3   | M-2 | M-1 | Average | M -5 | M -4 | M -3 | M-2  | M-1 | Average | M -5 | M -4 | M -3 | M-2 | M-1  | Average |  |  |  |  |  |
| Comprises following criteria of marking.                 |   |            |  |      |      |     |     |         |      |  |      |     |     |         |      |      |  |     |     |         |      |      |      |  |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1  | Firm should have 8 to 10 year of Audit experience (evedence required) (Point 8=15, 9=20 & 10=25)                            | 25         | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25  | 25  | 25      | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25  | 25  | 25      | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25  | 25  | 25      | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25  | 25      | 25   | 25   | 25   | 25  | 25   | 25      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2  | Firm should have 3 to 5 annual Audit experience in public sector organization (evedence required) (Point 3=10, 4=15 & 5=20) | 20         | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20  | 20  | 20      | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20  | 20  | 20      | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20  | 20  | 20      | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20  | 20      | 20   | 20   | 20   | 20  | 20   | 20      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3  | Firm should have no litigation (Evidence required).   | 10         | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10   | 10      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4  | Firm should have financial strenght with 8 to 10 million per annum (evedence required) (Point 8=5, 9=10 & 10=15)            | 15         | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15  | 15  | 15      | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15  | 15  | 15      | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15  | 15  | 15      | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15  | 15      | 15   | 15   | 15   | 15  | 15   | 15      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5  | Firm should have Satisfactory QCR Rating from Institute Chartered Account of Pakistan (ICAP) (evedence required)            | 10         | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10   | 10      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6  | Firm should have registered in all Tax Departments (evedence required).   | 10         | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10   | 10      |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7  | Firm should have on State Bank of Pakistan's (SBP'S) Panel of Approved Auditors (evedence required).                        | 10         | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10      | 10   | 10   | 10   | 10  | 10   | 10      |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total Marks/ Obtain Marks / Average Marks</b>         |   |            | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100 | 100 | 100     | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100 | 100 | 100     | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100 | 100 | 100     | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100 | 100     | 100  | 100  | 100  | 100 | 100  | 100     |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Minimum 70% marks to be qualified, Positions are:</b> |   |            | <b>1st</b>                                       |      |      |     |     |         |      | <b>1st</b>                                       |      |     |     |         |      |      | <b>1st</b>                                       |     |     |         |      |      |      | <b>1st</b>                                       |     |         |      |      |      |     |  |         |  |  |  |  |  |

Note: The Consultant Selection Committee is recommending on the above sheet listed firms to issue RFPs.

Members of Consultant Selection Committee

Mr. Ashfaq Hussain Meerani  
Assistant Director(RBCS)  
Member of Consultant Selection Committee  
Sindh Education Foundation  
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh  
Planning officer,  
Planning & Development Dept.  
Member of Consultant Selection Committee  
Sindh Education Foundation  
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,  
Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance  
Member of Consultant Selection Committee  
Sindh Education Foundation  
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Hadi Khan  
Deputy Director (PSDU)  
Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee  
Sindh Education Foundation  
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Aziz Kabani  
Director POP/DMD  
Chairman, Consultant Selection Committee  
Sindh Education Foundation  
Govt. of Sindh,

*Handwritten signatures and dates:*  
27/01/2016  
27/01/2016  
27-1-16